

**Puyallup School District
MUSIC TASK FORCE**

FINAL REPORT

to the

SUPERINTENDENT

February 23, 2009

February 23, 2009

Dear Superintendent Dr. Tony Apostle,

Re: Music Task Force Final Report

This report is in response to Washington State's current economic crisis and its foreseen impacts on K-12 education. It is also in response to the district's need to demonstrate adequate yearly progress as defined and measured by the Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction for Washington State.

The Music Task Force was charged with identifying implications of budget reductions at various levels, with a focus on elementary instrumental instruction. In addition to the financial concern, we were faced with a logistical concern. The current "pull-out" model, in an environment of high stakes accountability, creates conflict between colleagues and blurs our perceived priorities. Therefore, our task was two-fold: reduce operation costs and reduce the impact on the general education classroom.

It is with some hesitancy and concern that I present this report to you. The *realist* in me understands that we are facing economically difficult times and must prepare for the impact our school district will feel as a result of our state's growing financial deficit. However, the *idealist* in me believes that a strong arts program makes a tremendous impact on the developmental growth of every child. The long-standing district support of a sequential program of instrumental instruction has been a primary reason for student achievement in music *and* in other academic areas. Our dilemma has been *how to maintain a sequential program of music instruction during a season of dwindling resources*.

In reality, we must prepare for a drastic reduction in our district's budget. And because the current economic forecast suggests even greater financial deficit, we must prepare for the worst. In this report you will find a variety of options to consider along with a list of implications we believe you should keep in mind. While we understand that we are not charged with making recommendations, we have ordered the options beginning with those we feel have the fewest negative ramifications.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to provide input into this process. We appreciate having the chance to influence those making these very difficult decisions.

Sincerely,

Brian Fox
Director of Student Learning, K-12

Background

The Music Task Force was formed to identify implications of budget reductions at various levels. Our assignment was to consider various changes that could take place in our elementary instrumental instruction program and identify the effects of those changes. The task force was made up of the following educators:

Marc Brouillet, Principal, Zeiger
Andrew Burch, Band Teacher, EJH, Hilltop, Northwood
Brian Fox, Director of Student Learning, K-12
Coralie Gustafson, General Music Teacher, Sunrise
Kathy Gustafson, General Music Teacher, Firgrove, Zeiger
Cynthia Iverson, Orchestra Teacher, BJH, Brouillet, Carson, Firgrove, Zeiger
Lisa Russell-Nolan, Principal, Northwood

The Music Task Force met on the following dates and times;

February 3, 2009 4:00 – 6:00 pm
February 10, 2009 4:00 – 5:30 pm
February 17, 2009 4:00 – 6:00 pm

Format

The remainder of this report includes options we considered, including our current service-delivery model. Each option is summarized in a one-page document which is followed by details, data, and a complete listing of implications. For each discussion, our goal was to view scenarios through two lenses: one advocating for the general education student, and one for the band or orchestra student. Our “higher purposes” included the following:

- Maintain a sequential program of instrumental instruction including the elementary level
- Maintain music instruction as part of our culture and language
- Reduce interruptions of whole group instruction in the general education classroom
- Ensure academic success for each student

Each option summary includes the following:

- Overview
- Requirements
- Positive Implications
- Negative Implications
- Budget Considerations
 - Calculations are made with 1.0 FTE = \$80,000.00
- Additional Data

CURRENT MODEL

“Pull-out” Band and Orchestra

Overview

Students in grade 5 are given the opportunity to begin band or orchestra instruction, and may continue their study in grade 6. Participating students leave the general education classroom twice each week for a 45 minutes session with a certificated music instructor. Band and orchestra are scheduled for simultaneous instruction on every day except Wednesday.

Requirements

- 4.4 FTE Orchestra teachers (.2 per elementary)
- 4.4 FTE Band teachers (.2 per elementary)
- Two teaching spaces per elementary

Positive Implications

- Supports a strong instrumental music program at the secondary level
- Introduces instrumental instruction prior to junior high when there are many competing interests
- Allows equal access since it is offered during the school day
- Provides general classroom teacher with 90 minutes of smaller class size for purposes of remediation or enrichment

Negative Implications

- Requires students to make a choice, between band/orchestra and other instruction or activities taking place elsewhere at school (classroom instruction, recess, etc)
- Provides only one entry point for elementary students – grade 5
- Prevents some students from receiving important general education instruction
- Reduces *whole group* instruction in the general education classroom 90 minutes each week

Budget Considerations

- This model costs the district approximately \$704,000.00 in employment.

Additional Data (Tables 1 and 2)

- Building specific band and orchestra enrollment 2008-2009

Cost = \$704,000.00

Table 1

Number of Elementary Band Students 2008-09					
TEACHER	SCHOOL	5th Grade Students	6th Grade Students	TOTAL PER SCHOOL	TOTAL PER TEACHER
Burch, Andy	Northwood	25	14	39	
	Hilltop	17	9	26	65
Carollo, Kit	Karshner	31	9	40	40
Fry, Scott	Hunt	50	25	75	
	Wildwood	25	17	42	117
Jacobson, Gary	Mt. View	8	5	13	
	Maplewood	12	9	21	
	Meeker	27	17	44	
	Sunrise	20	4	24	
	Fruitland	39	23	62	164
Miles, Peter	Shaw Rd.	33	30	63	
	Woodland	39	18	57	
	Waller Rd.	18	13	31	
	Spinning	18	5	23	174
Rink, Bob	Ridgecrest	30	15	45	45
Roe, Catherine	Brouillet	46	24	70	70
Spray, Allison	Edgerton	47	15	62	62
Thill, Rick	Firgrove	52	15	67	67
Wagner, Ryan	Zeiger	33	32	65	
	Stewart	14	10	24	
	Pope	34	26	60	
	Carson	52	24	76	225
TOTAL		416	227	643	643

Table 2

Number of Orchestra Students 2008-09					
TEACHER	SCHOOL	5th Grade Students	6th Grade Students	TOTAL PER SCHOOL	TOTAL PER TEACHER
Giltner, Todd	Maplewood	6	8	14	
	Fruitland	20	6	26	
	Woodland	21	7	28	68
Grenzer, Matthew	Ridgecrest	15	8	23	
	Pope	21	4	25	
	Meeker	9	7	16	
	Sunrise	13	5	18	82
Iverson, Cynthia	Brouillet	15	11	26	
	Carson	28	11	39	
	Firgrove	23	5	28	
	Zeiger	10	12	22	115
Johnson, Catherine	Hilltop	8	2	10	
	Mt. View	13	4	17	
	Northwood	4	8	12	
	Waller Rd.	6	10	16	55
Pelandini, Rebecca	Spinning	11	3	14	
	Shaw Rd.	9	6	15	
	Stewart	14	2	16	
	Wildwood	8	7	15	60
Preheim, Kristy	Karshner	10	12	22	22
Westgaard, Paula	Hunt	35	6	41	
	Edgerton	14	6	20	61
TOTAL		313	150	463	463

Option A Regionalized Band and Orchestra Before School (5th and 6th)

Overview

Students in grades 5 and 6 could have instrumental instruction before their school day begins by attending class at regional sites around the district. This could include the use of junior high school band and orchestra classrooms during first period, and nearby schools' multi-purpose rooms (gyms). Transportation to class could be provided by the district, and would be necessary in order to shuttle students to their elementary buildings.

Requirements

- Instructional space at each junior high school during their first period
- Additional instructional space at nearby schools (i.e. Stahl/Brouillet or Ballou/Firgrove)
- Transportation
 - Students would ride junior high buses to band/orchestra
 - Students would require shuttle buses from the junior high schools to their elementary schools

Positive Implications

- 90 minutes per week added to the general education classroom schedule for whole group instruction
- Maintains a sequential instrumental music program beginning at elementary
- Maintains a K-6 program for general music studies
- Could offer "beginning band/orchestra" to students in sixth-grade (we currently begin at 5th-grade only)

Negative Implications

- Additional staff required for support with large classes (possibly para-educators) *see budget consideration below*
- Parents may express concern regarding early morning bus stops and/or elementary students using bus routes for the junior high schools
- Budget constraints may lead to parent-provided transportation
- Possible conflict with existing "before-school" activities such as elementary chorus

Budget Considerations

- Reduces band FTE by 1.8 (currently 4.4 FTE)
- Reduces orchestra FTE by 2.9 (currently 4.4 FTE)
- This model costs the district approximately \$376,000.00 less in employment of certificated music teachers
- If enrollment in the program increases, thus requiring additional staffing, further costs may be incurred. For example, if we hire 13 support staff to assist with large classes. At \$15 hourly, this may cost the district \$28,000 in additional staffing
- Cost for shuttle buses has yet to be determined

Additional Data (Table 3 - upper portion)

- Staffing calculation for "before school" instruction

Potential savings = \$348,000 - \$376,000
(Less transportation costs)

Table 3

Staffing calculations for "before school" instruction

2008-2009

	teachers	FTE
Band	10	4.4
Orch	7	4.4

Band/Orchestra Before School With Existing Enrollment

	5th Band	teachers	6th Band	teachers	FTE	add support	5th Orch	teachers	6th Orch	teachers	FTE	add support
EJH	50	1	28	1	0.2	1	25	1	14	1	0.2	
KJH	65	2	45	1	0.3	1	34	1	11	1	0.2	
AJH	127	3	71	2	0.5	2	51	1	43	1	0.2	2
BJH	124	3	65	2	0.5	1	54	1	24	1	0.2	1
SJH	98	2	48	1	0.3	3	43	1	22	1	0.2	1
GVJH	131	3	66	2	0.5	1	70	2	16	1	0.3	
FJH	75	2	36	1	0.3	0	36	1	20	1	0.2	
Totals	670	16	359	10	2.6	9	313	8	150	7	1.5	4

Band/Orchestra Before School With Existing Enrollment

	6th Band	teachers	FTE	add support	6th Orch	teachers	FTE	add support
EJH	28	1	0.2		14	1	0.2	
KJH	45	1	0.2	1	11	1	0.2	
AJH	71	2	0.4		43	1	0.2	1
BJH	65	2	0.4		24	1	0.2	
SJH	48	1	0.2	1	22	1	0.2	
GVJH	66	1	0.2	1	16	1	0.2	
FJH	36	1	0.2		20	1	0.2	
Totals	359	9	1.8	3	150	7	1.4	1

Student:Teacher Ratio	
0-40	1 FTE
41-60	1 FTE + support
61-80	2 FTE

Option A

Additional Implications

- Class sizes would be monitored for changes in enrollment with FTE adjusted accordingly
- Coordination with administration at host sites would be critical, especially when building the master schedules at the junior high schools
- To keep students at one building, use of junior high multi-purpose rooms could be considered
- Transportation department would have to understand that some large instruments will take up space on the bus and plan accordingly
- Communication with parents regarding the change to early morning bus schedules would need to begin ASAP
- Equal access will become an issue if district transportation is not provided
- This option would support the current practice and recommendation from the 2005 Music Committee to provide simultaneous instruction of band and orchestra at the elementary level
- Students choosing band/orchestra would still have the opportunity to participate in general music class during their instructional day
- This option will impact before school chorus
- Implementing this option might require that all 22 elementary general music teachers agree to offer chorus during recess, lunch, or after school in order to continue offering choices and allow students to experiment before making a commitment to an instrument or a sequence of musical study
- Scheduling of staff would have to be done very carefully so as to honor a 7.5 hour work day
- Communication early-on with area daycare providers would be beneficial

Option B Regionalized Band and Orchestra Before School (6th only)

Overview

Students in grade 6 could have instrumental instruction take place before their school day began by attending class at regional sites around the district. This could include the use of junior high school band and orchestra classrooms during first period, and nearby schools' multi-purpose rooms (gyms). Transportation to class could be provided by the district, and would be necessary in order to shuttle students to their elementary buildings. This model differs from option #2 in that 6th-grade students would be *beginners* on their instrument. In this option, 6th-grade students receive instruction 3 days each week. *Woodwind students* would attend 2 days, *Brass students* would attend two days, and the whole band would attend on one day. This increases the amount of instructional time by one day, and improves the student-teacher ratio.

Requirements

- Instructional space at each junior high school during their first period
- Transportation
 - Students would ride junior high buses to band/orchestra
 - Students would require shuttle buses from the junior high schools to their elementary schools

Positive Implications

- 90 minutes per week added to the general education classroom schedule for whole group instruction
- Maintains a sequential instrumental music program beginning at elementary
- Maintains a K-6 program for general music studies

Negative Implications

- Would require additional staff (possibly para-educators) for support with large classes
- Parents may express concern regarding early morning bus stops and/or elementary students using bus routes for the junior high schools
- Budget constraints may lead to parent-provided transportation
- Possible conflict with existing "before-school" activities such as elementary chorus

Budget Considerations

- Reduces band FTE by 2.6 (currently 4.4 FTE)
- Reduces orchestra FTE by 3.0 (currently 4.4 FTE)
- This model costs the district approximately \$448,000.00 less in employment of certificated music teachers.
- If enrollment in the program increases, thus requiring additional staffing, further costs may be incurred. For example, if we hire 4 support staff to assist with large classes. At \$15 hourly, this may cost the district \$8,640 in additional staffing.
- Cost for shuttle buses has yet to be determined

Additional Data (Table 3 – lower portion)

- Staffing calculation for "before school" instruction

Potential savings = \$339,000-\$448,000
(Less transportation costs)

Option B
Additional Implications

- This option would negatively impact our program of sequential instruction – one year less without an instrument in-hand
- Could create pride among 6th-grade students and promote a “middle-school elite”

Option C

Instrumental instruction as an option along with general music

*Because this model is in place in other school districts, we explored possibilities in Puyallup. However, the task force does not consider this a viable option.

Overview

In this scenario, 5th and 6th grade students would either choose from band/orchestra/general music, or be divided in thirds so as to create balance among the three strands not necessarily by student choice. Instruction would take place during the students' school day and at his/her own elementary building.

Requirements

- Instructional space for both band and orchestra (up to 56 students in one school) **and**,
- Instructional space at each elementary building for up to 3 general music classrooms
- Up to 6 music teachers at a site at one time

Positive Implications

- Increased time in the general education classroom schedule for whole group instruction
- Common grade level planning time for 5th and 6th grade teachers
- School day access to instrumental music instruction

Negative Implications

- Lack of teaching space at most facilities
- Requires additional general music teachers, teaching spaces, and materials/resources at many sites to accommodate simultaneous instruction
 - Scheduling of general music teachers would be **extremely** challenging
- Eliminates general music instruction for up to 2/3 of both 5th and 6th grades district-wide
- Length of sessions will have to be either 45 minutes (as it is for our current band and orchestra students) or 30 minutes (which is consistent for general music and other "specialists" sessions at the elementary level)
- Balancing class sizes may be challenging if we emphasize student choice
- Protests from both students and parents may be challenging if we force classes into thirds
- Currently, we administer the CBPA (Classroom-Based Performance Assessment) in the 5th-grade general music classroom
 - CBPA could be administered in 4th-grade
 - CBPA could be administered in general music AND band AND orchestra classrooms
 - Would require additional training for band/orchestra teachers

Budget Considerations

- Still requires 4.4 FTE for Band and 4.4 FTE for Orchestra
- Given our current assignment of 23.4 FTE for elementary general music, this scenario requires
 - 4.05 FTE fewer using existing band/orchestra enrollment (\$324,000)
 - 5.15 FTE fewer when dividing classes into thirds (\$412,000)

Additional Data (Table 4)

- Staffing calculations for "student choice" music instruction

Potential Savings = \$324,000 - \$412,000

Table 4

Staffing Calculations for "student choice" music instruction

School	08-09 Music FTE	K-4 classes	Gen Music FTE	Total 5	Orch 5	Band 5	Gen 5	5th Teachers	Total 6	Orch 6	Band 6	Gen 6	6th Teachers	5/6 Gen FTE	09-10 Music FTE	09-10 Music FTE adjusted	net	adjusted net
Brouillet	1.4	20	1	92	15	46	31	4	83	11	24	48	4	0.15	1.15		0.25	
Brouillet adjusted	1.4	20	1	92	30	30	31	3	83	27	27	28	3	0.1		1.1		0.3
Carson	1.6	25	1.25	138	28	52	58	5	124	11	24	89	4	0.25	1.5		0.1	
Carson adjusted	1.6	25	1.25	138	46	46	46	3	124	41	41	42	3	0.1		1.35		0.25
Edgerton	1.2	19	0.95	96	8	47	41	5	87	8	15	64	5	0.2	1.15		0.05	
Edgerton adjusted	1.2	19	0.95	96	32	32	32	6	87	29	29	29	6	0.1		1.05		0.15
Firgrove	1.8	26	1.3	121	23	52	46	5	105	5	15	85	5	0.25	1.55		0.25	
Firgrove adjusted	1.8	26	1.3	121	40	40	41	6	105	35	35	35	3	0.1		1.4		0.4
Fruitland	1.1	16	0.8	90	20	39	31	3	89	6	23	60	3	0.1	0.9		0.2	
Fruitland adjusted	1.1	16	0.8	90	30	30	30	3	89	30	30	29	3	0.1		0.9		0.2
Hilltop	0.5	6	0.3	33	8	17	8	4	32	2	9	21	4	0.1	0.4		0.1	
Hilltop adjusted	0.5	6	0.3	33	11	11	11	3	32	11	11	10	3	0.1		0.4		0.1
Hunt	1.5	21	1.05	110	19	50	41	3	139	20	25	94	3	0.25	1.3		0.2	
Hunt adjusted	1.5	21	1.05	110	36	36	37	3	139	46	46	47	3	0.15		1.2		0.3
Karshner	0.8	12	0.6	50	25	20	5	4	45	25	20	0	4	0.05	0.65		0.15	
Karshner adjusted	0.8	12	0.6	50	16	16	17	3	45	15	15	15	3	0.1		0.7		0.1
Maplewood	0.7	10	0.5	27	6	12	9	3	56	8	9	39	3	0.15	0.65		0.05	
Maplewood adjusted	0.7	10	0.5	27	9	9	9	3	56	18	18	19	3	0.1		0.6		0.1
Meeker	0.8	11	0.55	62	9	27	22	4	62	8	17	41	5	0.15	0.7		0.1	
Meeker adjusted	0.8	11	0.55	62	20	20	21	3	62	20	20	21	3	0.1		0.65		0.15
Mountain View	0.7	8	0.4	53	13	8	32	4	38	4	5	29	4	0.1	0.5		0.2	
Mountain View adjusted	0.7	8	0.4	53	17	17	18	3	38	12	12	13	4	0.1		0.5		0.2
Northwood	0.6	9	0.45	36	4	25	7	5	43	8	14	21	5	0.1	0.55		0.05	
Northwood adjusted	0.6	9	0.45	36	12	12	12	6	43	14	14	15	6	0.1		0.55		0.05
Pope	1.4	19	0.95	91	12	34	43	3	91	13	26	52	2	0.2	1.15		0.25	
Pope adjusted	1.4	19	0.95	91	30	30	31	3	91	30	30	31	3	0.1		1.05		0.35
Ridgecrest	1.05	14	0.6	71	12	30	29	3	69	12	15	42	4	0.15	0.75		0.3	
Ridgecrest adjusted	1.05	14	0.6	71	23	23	24	3	69	23	23	23	3	0.1		0.7		0.35
Shaw Road	1.25	15	0.75	76	7	33	36	3	79	8	30	41	3	0.2	0.95		0.3	
Shaw Road adjusted	1.25	15	0.75	76	25	25	26	3	79	26	26	27	4	0.1		0.85		0.4

School	08-09 Music FTE	K-4 classes	Gen Music FTE	Total 5	Orch 5	Band 5	Gen 5	5th Teachers	Total 6	Orch 6	Band 6	Gen 6	6th Teachers	5/6 Gen FTE	09-10 Music FTE	09-10 Music FTE adjusted	net	adjusted net
Spinning	0.8	10	0.5	46	7	18	21	3	46	8	5	20	3	0.1	0.6		0.2	
Spinning adjusted	0.8	10	0.5	46	15	15	16	3	46	15	15	16	3	0.1		0.6		0.2
Stewart	0.6	9	0.45	41	7	14	20	3	37	7	10	20	3	0.1	0.55		0.05	
Stewart adjusted	0.6	9	0.45	41	13	13	14	3	37	12	12	13	3	0.1		0.55		0.05
Sunrise	1	13	0.65	56	10	20	26	3	65	10	4	51	3	0.15	0.8		0.2	
Sunrise adjusted	1	13	0.65	56	18	18	19	3	65	21	21	22	3	0.1		0.75		0.25
Waller Road	0.8	10	0.5	42	6	18	18	3	54	10	13	31	4	0.1	0.6		0.2	
Waller Road adjusted	0.8	10	0.5	42	14	14	14	3	54	18	18	18	3	0.1		0.6		0.2
Wildwood	1.2	17	0.85	62	6	25	31	4	88	7	7	74	4	0.15	1		0.2	
Wildwood adjusted	1.2	17	0.85	62	20	20	21	3	88	29	29	30	3	0.1		0.95		0.25
Woodland	1.4	19	0.95	104	21	39	44	3	101	7	18	76	3	0.25	1.2		0.2	
Woodland adjusted	1.4	19	0.95	104	34	34	35	3	101	33	33	34	3	0.1		1.05		0.35
Zeiger	1.4	17	0.85	82	10	33	39	3	107	12	32	63	3	0.2	1.05		0.35	
Zeiger adjusted	1.4	17	0.85	82	27	27	28	3	107	35	35	36	3	0.1		0.95		0.45
total																	4.05	5.15

Option C
Additional Implications

- Purchase of instruments and other materials may be necessary to provide equity in simultaneous instruction – especially at large buildings
- May create conflict among PEA members if 5th/6th grade teachers receive 45 minute planning times
- May create conflict among PEA members if 5th/6th grade teachers receive common planning periods
- State EALRs and GLEs might be required of band and orchestra teachers as they plan for instruction (to a greater degree than is currently in place)
- Would students forced into band or orchestra be required to continue their study in junior high?

Option D

Elimination of elementary instrumental instruction

Overview

In this option instrumental instruction no longer becomes available to elementary students. Beginning band and orchestra becomes available only at 7th-grade.

Requirements

Additional FTE at the junior high level to accommodate beginning band/orchestra students

Positive Implications

- Increased time in the general education classroom schedule for whole group instruction

Negative Implications

- Loss of sequential instrumental music program beginning at the elementary level
- Student achievement in the secondary music programs would be drastically reduced
- Will disappoint elementary students and their parents
- Junior high students will become distracted by the many other options offered at the junior high level
- Decreased enrollment in the entire instrumental music program
- Increased responsibility for general music teacher to encourage students in considering participation in instrumental music instruction in the junior high schools
- This option ends a long-standing tradition in Puyallup of providing quality music instruction and will certainly lead to a decline in student achievement in the secondary music department
- Implementing this option is in opposition to the research which indicates that student engagement in music education improves student achievement in all academic areas

Budget Considerations

- Reduces band FTE by 4.4 (\$352,000)
- Reduces orchestra FTE by 4.4 (\$352,000)

Potential Savings = \$704,000